(v) Twenty-Eighth Report on Action Taken by the Government on Eleventh Report—Demands for Grants (1994-95) of the Ministry of Food Processing Industries.

RE. REPORT ON BUDGET PUBLISHED IN THE NEWSPAPERS.

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): Madam, I would like to raise a very important issue. (*Interruptions*). ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, there is a very bad accident in Tamil Nadu where over 60 people died. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There will be a statement by the Minister at 5 o'clock. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, I want to raise a serious matter. This relates to .. (*Interruptions*). ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, there is... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There will be a statement by the Minister at 5 o'clock. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Is it regarding the accident in Tamil Nadu?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, there will be a statement regarding the accident in Tamil Nadu. (*Interruptions*)... What is the problem? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, this relates to a grave parliamentary impropriety. Therefore, Madam, I seek your kind indulgence. (*Interruptions*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not done by others.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, the presentation of the General Budget, its discussion and its reply are some of the most important exercises of the Parliament. It is the responsibility of the Finance Minister that he places the Budget only before the Parliament. Similarly, the reply to the Budget discussion can also be made only before the Parliament. But, Madam, to our great surprise and shock we have come to know that today's newspapers have reported that the Finance Minister has replied to most of the issues, which have been raised by the Members during the Budget discussion, in the Congress Parliamentary Party meeting. We want to know whether it is proper for the Finance Minister to do that. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, what is this? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, had it been at the time of his first Budget, one could have understood that he was not sufficiently experienced with the parliamentary propriety. (Interruptions)... The way in which these kinds of issues are dealt with (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, it is a matter of the Congress Party. (*Interruptions*)... We have asked questions. Madam, it would be ridiculous to allow it. (*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, it is not all related to parliamentary propriety. The allegation made by...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, as members of the Congress Party we have asked questions. He has answered them. (Interruptions)... They don't have anything to do with the affairs of the Congress Party. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, may I seek your indulgence? (*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, we have a right to discuss the problem. The Finance Minister has presented the Budget. (*Interruptions*)... The Budget has already been laid on the Table of the House. (*Interruptions*) ...We can discuss it in our own party forum. (*Inttrruptions*).... I think it is an irrelevant question. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, may I make a submission? (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, you know the sanctity of the Parliament. I want to know... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: There is no other single issue to be raised by them. (*Interuptions*)...It is an affairs of the Congress Party. We are not going to allow them to raise it during Zero Hour. (*Interruptions*)... Madam, it is a total abuse of the parliamentary process. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, may I be permitted to finish?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: We don't want to hear anything more. (*Interruptions*).... Madam, I am raising a point of order. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. A. BABY: What I want to know is whether the parliamentary procedure has any sanctity or not. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, may I make a submission? (*Interruptions*).... Madam, may I make a submission?. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear her point of order. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I have a point. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: She has allowed me. (*Interrupions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear her point of order. (*Interruptions*). I will allow you. (*Interruptions*). Let me hear her point of order. Let me apply my mind to it.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, when Mr. Baby talked about the grave breach of Parliamentary propriety, we all listened to him silently because all of us are one to see that the respect and dignity of this House is upheld—of Parliament as a whole. Madam, the issue he is raising is totally an internal matter of the Congress party. The Finance Minister made no statement of any policy. He made no statement which was not there in the Budget. In an internal meeting of the Congress party he answered whatever doubts the Members raised about the Budget.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, under what rule is she raising this point of order? (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She is explaining her viewpoint. (*Interruptions*). She is explaining the position. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, therefore, it cannot be raised here. (*Interruptions*). Madam, I have not yet finished my point of order. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me settle this matter. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I have not yet finished my point of order. (*Interruptions*). Madam, they are not allowing me to complete my point of order. My point of order is that this is not an issue that can be raised on the floor of this House. This is an internal matter of the Congress party. He cannot raise it on the floor of the House as an issue. Madam, he cannot seek your permission to raise this issue. This is not a matter for Zero Hour. I request you not to permit him to raise something which is purely an internal matter of the Congress party. (Interruptions).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, my point is... (*Interruptions*).

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम मेरा भी एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us not take more time on this issue (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I agree that any discussion can take place in a party meeting. (*Interruptions*). I agree that they can discuss the Budget in their party meeting and the Finance Minister can also reply to it. But the point is... (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam,... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, please allow me to speak. My point is, every party is entitled to discuss a matter of public importance within the party, in the party organisation. But that must be an inner party issue. Madam, the entire proceedings were widely reported in the Press. It was reported in all the newspapers. I can produce the newspapers. (*Interruptions*). It is not a leakage. It is as if... (*Interruptions*). Madam, please allow me to speak. This is the newspaper... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar): There is a policy matter. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, please allow me to speak. (*Interruptions*). Madam, will you allow me to speak? (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. (*Interruptions*). Just a minute. Let us not make... (*Interruptions*). Let us not argue. Some Members feel that there is a matter of propriety and some Members of the Congress party feel it is not. Let me apply my mind. You have made your point. She made her point. From her point of view...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I have not completed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, please be brief because I have a lot of names. We have to go ahead. I have not read the report. I cannot say whether it is a policy matter or a non-policy matter. Please don't make a long speech.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: My point is this. We are having two Chambers. Parliament is composed of two Chambers, Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha. Lok Sabha, Rajya Sabha and the President make Parliament. The whole thing is reported as if there is a third chamber. The whole discussion continued there publicly and the Finance Minister committed impropriety because it was a public discussion. It was a public discussion... (*Interruptions*) If it was not a public discussion, why did they report it in the Press? It was not confined to the party meeting... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Total bankruptcy of issues. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: This is where impropriety was committed. I wish the hon. Finance Minister, who is known for his renpect to the Parliamestary system, kindly stand up and clarify the position... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : Total bankruptcy of issues... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: What is this... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : मैडम मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

उपसभापति : आप ब्रीफ में बोलिएगा ।

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : बहुत ब्रीफ में बोलूंगा । दो मिनट में अपनी बात खत्म कर दूगा । मैडम यह जो सत्ता पक्ष है .... (**व्यवधान**)...व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। यह जो सरकारी पार्टी है हर सवाल को अखबार में पहले दे देती है । मैं यह जानबझकर कह रहा हूं । मैडम वित्त मंत्री की एक सरकारी हैसियत होती है (**व्यवधान**) आप बैठिए जयन्ती जी मैं खिलाफ नहीं बोल रहा हूं । वित्त मंत्री की, प्रधान मंत्री की या गृह मंत्री की एक सरकारी हैसियत होती है मैडम।

वह अपनी पार्टी की मीटिंग में भी सरकारी हैसियत के हिसाब से जब जवाब देते हैं तो हम लोगों के लिए दिक्कत हो जाती है । अखबार में छपने के बाद कि कांग्रेस पार्लियामेंटरी पार्टी में जो बहस हुई, उस पाइंट को उठाकर कहें तो आप कहेंगे कि हमारा अंदरूनी मामला है हमारी पार्टी के बारे में क्यों बोल रहे हैं ? इसलिए वित्त मंत्री जी ने जो कहा वहां तक ठीक है लेकिन वह अखबार में नहीं छपना चाहिए था ।

मैडम एक ओर केस हो गया कि किसी मंत्री को सरकार में लेना है उसके पहले प्रधान मंत्री जी ने अखबार में नाम दे दिया कि मैं इनको लेने जा रहा हूं। मैडम पहले नाम राष्ट्रपति जी को जाएगा या पहले नाम अखबार को जाएगा ? तो यह प्रधान मंत्री से लेकर वित्त मंत्री तक अपने नाम के लिए पब्लिसिटी ले रहे हैं । यहां करूणाकरण जी बैठे हैं । वे बहुत बुजुर्ग नेता है ।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: What is wrong in that?... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : इनका नाम एक महीने पहले छप गया कि इनको मिनिस्ट्री में लिया जा रहा है, लेकिन अभी तक राष्ट्रपति जी के यहां नाम नहीं गया । मैडम यह परंपरा बहुत गलत पड़ रही है कि प्रधान मंत्री या वित्त मंत्री अखबारों को अपनी बात कह दें और हम लोग पार्लियामेंट में कांग्रेस पार्टी के एतराज पर इन बातों को न उठाएं ।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: This has become a total debate. From the Finance Minister, they have now come to the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

Please put a stop to this ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The matter is closed now. I am not allowing any more discussion on this.

Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)... Please keep quiet... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, he cannot speak to the Press ..(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Karunakaran wants to say something... ...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, I have two eyes and a pair of spectacles also. It is

for me to decide who should speak and who should not speak. If Mr. Karunakaran wants to speak, he can ask me and I will permit him. He is a hon. Member of this House. Now, the matter was regarding the reply of the Finance Minister to the discussion they had in the party meeting. I have not read the whole report that appeared in the newspapers. Any decision on policy matters should not be taken outside the Parliament, especially when the Parliament is in session. That propriety, we have always maintained. I do not know whether the reply was given. I will go through the reports. But from what Ms Jayanthi Natarajan has said, I understand that it was not a policy discussion. No policy statement was made by him... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It is absolutely wrong. The hon. Finance Minister has given his opinion on policy matters ..(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No more discussion... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: They have no respect for your ruling ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : मैडम, आपकी रूलिंग एक विषय पर आई लेकिन प्रधान मंत्री से संबंधित भी सवाल आया है, उसके बारे में भी आप अपनी राय दे दीजिए । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow you on that question Please sit down... (*Interruptions*) ... Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)... Just a minute ...(*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. If some Members still feel that it is a policy matter, they may show the report to me. They may move a privilege motion against the Finance Minister. Let the Chairman look into it. But please don't waste the time of the House. Let us go ahead because we have the Charar issue which we have to finish today.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): There is no necessity to move a privilege motion. You can decide it. So, there is no necessity for a privilege motion... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, it has never happened. It has never happened in the past. I submit that it has never happened in the past. It has never happened in the past Madam.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त) : मैडम, आपने कहा कि अखबार मैंने पढ़ा नहीं कि पालिसी पर कहा गया या नहीं, आप प्लीज पढ़ लीजिए पहले । उसके बाद रूलिंग दीजिए । ...(**व्यवधान**)

†اشری سکندر بخت: میڈم - آپنے کہا کہ اخبار میں نے پڑھا نہیں کہ پالیسی پر کہا گیا یا نہیں - آپ پلیز پڑھ لیجئے پہلے - اسکے بعد رولنگ دی جائے - "مداخلت"

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I submit never before has any Finance Minister taken such an unprecedented step of replying to a debate in Parliament in a Congress party meeting which was widely publicised. Never before has this happened.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gupta, please sit down... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : एक मिनट में यह बात कही जा सकती है । .... (**व्यवधान**)...उनसे क्या पूछेंगे । .... (**व्यवधान**)...एक मिनट में फाइनेन्स

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

मिनिस्टर यह दें कि हमने ऐसी कोई बात नहीं कही, हमने कोई पालिसी मैटर डिस्कस नहीं किया। ...(व्यवधान)... पूरे सदन का समय बर्बाद हो रहा है। The hon. Finance Minister is sitting here. Let him speak. There are so many... (*Interruptions*) .. The Finance Minister is sitting in the House. Let him clarify the matter... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam, there is no substance in the demand. Then, why should the Finance Minister clarify the matter?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSION AND THE MINISTRY OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): Madam, there is nothing new in this... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTTINAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, let the Finance Minister clarify the matter. Let him make a clarification.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: The Leader of the House wants to say something. Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Madam, this is a very extraordinary situation in which some hon. Members seem to be very much agitated. They are agitated over a report as published in the newspapers. I am sure that every party here has a right to have discussions amongst the Members of that party. When we discussed amongst ourselves, are you within your rights to deny us the right? Are you going to say that the Congress party should not discuss? I can understand if you pointed out an instance where there was a breach of privilege. If there be any breach of privilege, certainly you are within your rights to raise the matter. But the fact that it was discussed in the Congress party meeting and that it was reported in the newspapers—there are a number of reports which are reported in the news papers—how are you going to take objection to it... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear him. I want to hear the Leader of the House.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Madam, it is very unfortunate. In a democratic set-up, every party has a right to have discussions amongst its Members. The Congress party being the ruling party, there is all the more reason that the Members of the party should be able to have discussions amongst themselves. But if there is any doubt in the mind of any hon. Member either about the Finance Minister or about any other Minister, the Minister concerned should clarify the position. There is nothing wrong in it.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: That is not the point expressed by us. That is not the point. We are objecting to the public discussion. We are objecting to the public reply given by the hon. Finance Minister Every party is entitled to have discussions internally. But there cannot be any public discussion. But the hon. Finance Minister, before giving a reply in Parliament, cannot reply in other forums publicly on the issues involving the Budget. It cannot be... (*Interruptions*)... It cannot be. It has never happened. It has never happened in the past.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, this is not something new ...(*Interruptions*)... This has always happened. It always happens

...(*Interruptions*)... It happens with every party... (*Interruptions*) ...This is not something new... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति जी, जनेश्वर मिश्र जी ने एक पाइंट रेज किया है और वह संबंधित है प्राइम मिनिस्टर से कि उन्होंने इसी माननीय सदन के राज्यसभा के एक सदस्य का नाम प्रेस-कांफ्रेंस में लेकर कहा कि उनको अपनी कौन्सिल आफ मिनिस्टर में ले रहे हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Malaviya, I cannot allow you. I am not allowing you...(*Interruptions*) ...I am not allowing you..(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय: आज तक कभी ऐसा नहीं हुआ कि किसी प्रधानमंत्री ने किसी प्रेस कांफ्रेंस में ऐसा कहा हो। ...(**व्यवधान**)...उन्होंने नाम लिया है और वह नाम लिया है इसी माननीय सदन के सदस्य माननीय करुणाकरण जी का।...

(**व्यवधान**)... तो मेरा निवेदन यह है कि अखबार को बताने से पहले प्रधान मंत्री जी को राष्ट्रपति जी के पास नाम भेजना चाहिए था। तो मेरा निवेदन यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री ने इम्प्रोप्राइटी किया है, मैं इस पर व्यवस्था चाहता हूं।...(**व्यवधान**)...

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: (दिल्ली): मैडम, मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing any more discussion. (*Interruptions*) I am not allowing anything.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: मैडम, मैं एक बात ...(**व्यवधान**)...

उपसभापति: वही बात है।

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: मैडम, बात नहीं है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, I have not read it. I can't decide whether it is policy or non-policy. If it is non-policy, there is no impropriety.

प्रो० विजय कुमार: मैडम, मैं पालिसी की बात न रहा हूं। मुझे यह कहना है, आपसे कि कांग्रेस पार्टी अपनी कोई मीटिंग करें, हमें कोई एतराज नहीं है, न कुछ भी डिस्कस करे, हमें कोई एतराज नहीं है। पर सारे मिनिस्टर्स ने एक चिट्ठी लिखी है सारे मैम्बर आफ पार्लियामेंट्स राज्य सभा को और उन्होंने यह कहा है कि कांग्रेस पार्लियामेंटरी पार्टी की मीटिंग के फैसले के मुताबिक मैं फलां-फलां अफसर को एप्वाइंट कर रहा हूं आप मैम्बरों की सारी बात-चीत के बारे में फैसला करने के लिए। अब मुझे अगर कोई चिठ्ठी आती है, how am I bound by the Congress Parliamentary Party's resolution?

कांग्रेस पार्लियामेंटरी पार्टी के फैसले के मुताबिक ये मिनिस्टर यह तय करते हैं कि फलां अफसर मेरी बातें सुनेगा, उससे आप कंसल्ट करें, इतने बजे उससे मिल सकते हैं, बात कर सकते हैं।

Is it propriety?

एक मिनिस्टर द्वारा कांग्रेस पार्लियामेंटरी पार्टी के फैसले के मुताबिक मुझे क्या चिट्ठी लिखी जाती है? राज्य सभा के बाकी मैम्बरों को क्यों चिट्ठी लिखी जाती है?...(**व्यवधान**)...मुझे क्यों यह बात लिखकर भेजी?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know who wrote that letter. I have no idea. (*Interruptions*)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, if you want I can show it to you tomorrow. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know. (*Interruptions*) I have no idea. I don't know anything about it. (*Interruptions*)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Madam, the letter has come from the Minister ...(*Interruptions*)... The Congress Party has passed a resolution. A particular officer has been appointed ...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know. I have not read it. I have not received any letter. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, I would like to make my intention clear, that we are moving a privilege motion against the Finance Minister...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. You give it to the Chairman, not to me.

SHRI M. A. BABY: It is a clear act of impropriety committed by the Finance Minister.. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. (*Interruptions*) Please, sit down. One minute, please. (*Interruptions*) Every Member is within his or her right to move a privilege motion, if they think so. It is entirely within the right of the Chairman to either accept it or reject it, if he thinks so. So, you can do whatever you want, but please, let me continue with my business. (*Interruptions*) But that is over. (*Interruptions*) That is over. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, my point is different. (*Interruptions*) I am not raising the issue which was raised... (*Interruptions*) My point is entirely different. The Congress Minister has ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is the same thing. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: Madam, the Central Ministers are informing the Members belonging to the Opposition that so and so officer has been appointed to communicate with them and that they should come up with proposals. This is the information that has been given to the Opposition Members. I would like to know whether the Ministers are entitled to communicate their own party decisions to Members of the Opposition. This is also a matter of impropriety. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know... (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. (*Interruptions*) I won't allow it. (*Interruptions*)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मैं एक जरूरी बात कह रहा था।

†श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा - میں ایک ضروری بات کہہ رہا تھا۔]

उपसभापति : सिकन्दर बख्त जी, बैठ जाइए । वे भी कुछ कह रहे हैं।

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: Madam, every party has got its own Members. But the Ministers are treating the Opposition Members as Members of their own party. Are they entitled to have that luxury? I want a ruling from you, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can't give any ruling because I have not received the letter. I have not seen that letter. I don't know anything about it. (*Interruptions*)

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : मैं आपको दिखा दूंगा वह लैटर ।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैडम, ऐसी चिट्ठियां हमको आती हैं .... (**व्यवधान**)...

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script

उपसभापति : माथुर साहब, बैठिए । बैठ जाइए ।

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Madam, we can show you the copies. Please take a decision.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. I am not allowing it. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: मैडम, मैं आपको दिखा दुंगा वह लैटर ।

श्री सिकंदर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मुझे यह अर्ज करना है। बेबी साहब ने जो सवाल प्रिविलेज का उठाया है, आपने कहा कि वह आपका काम है। मैं माफी चाहता हू और यह कहना चाहता हूं कि फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर का नाम इंवोल्वड है । इसको इतनी आसानी से इस किस्म से हल कर लेना बहुत दुरूस्त नहीं होगा । मैंने अर्ज किया था कि जो सवाल बेबी साहब ने उठाया है, उस पर आपने अपनी रूलिंग नहीं दी है । आप अखबार पढ़ लेने के बाद रूलिंग दे दीजिए । आपने कहा था कि मैंने चूंकि अखबार पढ़ा नहीं है इसलिए मैं इसके मुताल्लिक कुछ नहीं कह सकती हूं । उसको रूलिंग समझा गया । मैंने दरख्वास्त की थी कि मेहरबानी से अखबार पढ़िए और फिर रूलिंग दीजिए स्पेसिफिक ।

Why should Mr. Baby be made to go to the extent of moving a privilege motion on this?

आप अगर रूलिंग दे दें तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा । आप अभी तक उस मंजर तक न पहुंच जाइए एकदम मेरी दरख्वास्त है आपसे ।

†[شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ۔ مجھے یہ عرض کرنا ہے۔ بے۔جی۔ صاحب نے جو سوال پریویلیج کا اٹھایا ہے۔ آپنے کہا کہ وہ آپکا کام ہے۔ میں معافی چاہتا ہوں اور یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ فائنینس منسٹر کا نام انوالوڈ ہے اسکو اتنی آسانی سے اسکو حل کر لینا بہت درست نہیں ہوگا۔ میں نے عرض کیا تھا کہ جو سوال بے۔جی۔ صاحب نے اٹھایا ہے اسپر آپنے اپنی رولنگ نہیں دی ہے آپ اخبار پڑھ لینے کے بعد رولنگ دیدیجئے۔ آپنے کہا تھا کہ میں نے اخبار کیونکہ نہیں پڑھا ہے اسلئے میں اسکے متعلق کچھ نہیں کہہ سکتی ہوں۔ اسکو رولنگ سمجھا گیا۔ میں نے درخواست کی تھی کہ مہربانی سے اخبار پڑھئے اور پھر رولنگ دیجئے" اسپیسیفک]

Why should Mr. Baby be made to go to the extent of moving a privilege motion on this?

†[آپ اگر رولنگ دیدیں تو زیادہ اچھا ہوگا۔ آپ ابھی تک اس منظر تک نہ پہنچ جایئے ایکدم میری درخواست ہے آپ سے۔]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sibtey Razi, it was addressed to me. Let me handle it. Mr. Baby and every Member has freedom to give what they like. I don't direct the Members. They have the freedom to do that. I repeat that I have not read the report. I don't know. I would go and read it, then I will see. As

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

has been said on the floor of the House by Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan who is a senior Member of this House, there is no policy declaration in the statement of the Finance Minister. While I take her word, if it is contrary to that, I can't say it now. Now, Bill for introduction, Shri H. R. Bhardwaj.

THE ARBITRATION AND CONCILIATION BILL, 1995

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ): Madam, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill to consolidate and amend the law relating to domestic arbitration, international commercial arbitration and enforcement of foreign arbitral awards as also to define the law relating to conciliation and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.

The question was proposed.

SHRI JIBON ROY (West Bengal): Madam, I have some objections.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your problems?

SHRI JIBON ROY: This Bill looks like a draconian Bill. It was only circulated three days back. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If he is objecting to the introduction of the Bill he has a right to do it. ...(*Interruptions*)... I want to tell the Members to have a little patience in the House. He is in his full right to object to the introduction of a Bill. Let me hear his objection. You can't object to his objection It is within the rules, at least within the rules of Rajya Sabha. ...(*Interruptions*).

SYED SIBTEY RAZZI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, I have a point of order. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta is trying to table all these papers on the Table of the House. I think it is against the rules. ..(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar): He can't do it without the permission of the Chair... .(*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: If he has supreniended them for you, he can give them to you. ...(*Interruptions*)... He can't put the papers like this. ...(*Interruptions*)... He can go to the Chamber and place them there.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not doing that. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, what is this? ...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, this is extremely unfortunate. I did not want to lay it on the Table of the House. I know the rules. I was ascertaining from the Secretary-General.

I was only enquiring from the Secretary-Genearl, I would like to hand it over to the Deputy Chairman, tell me to whom I should hand it over. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: He is not such an ignorant person. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: What is this? ...(*Interruptions*)... What is this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Such practices undermine the dignity of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: No, no. ...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, I take exception to it. Madam, I submit that you must restrain this. This is unfortunate. This is extremely unfortunate.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: There are rules to lay something on the Table of the House. (Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: What is this? (*Interruptions*) This is very unfortunate. (*Interruptions*) What is the harm? Tell me. (*Interruptions*)

THE LEADER OF OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT): Everybody has a newspaper, what is this? (*Interruptions*)